



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

June 11, 2020

Mr. Jason Brooks
Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc
402 BNA Drive, Ste 300
Nashville, TN 37217

Re: **RFQ#1388657, Sidewalk and Bikeway Program Management Services**

Dear Mr Brooks:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above **RFQ# 1388657, Sidewalk and Bikeway Program Management Services**. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to **Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc** contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact **Jeremy Frye**, BAO Representative, at **615-862-6638** or at **jeremy.frye@nashville.gov**.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Buyer **Terri Ray** by email at **terri.ray@nashville.gov** Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

www.Nashville.gov
Phone: 615-862-6180
Fax: 615-862-6179

**RFQ 1388657 - SIDEWALK AND BIKEWAY PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Officer	Alfred Benesch & Company	Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc	Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc	Volkert Inc
Management Plan and Approach (45 points)	38.00	40.00	41.00	38.00
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.00	31.00	34.00	30.00
Relevant Project Experience (20 points)	16.00	17.00	16.00	16.00
Total (100 points)	86.00	88.00	91.00	84.00

Alfred Benesch & Company

Strengths – Proposed key personnel of team structure demonstrated past experience with managing of sidewalk and bikeway projects. Proposed team structure included an asset management advisor. Approach took into consideration the of new Design-Build element of the program. Proposed project management plan included video conferencing option along with making numerous site visits. Proposal included utilizing BlueToad sensors technology at strategic locations to collect both vehicular and multi-modal preliminary traffic data. Proposal demonstrated an understanding of the need for alternative approaches. Proposal included unit cost estimating database system to assist with controlling cost. Proposal included an approach that considered tree protection along with develop services. Proposed approach has been successful in both Chicago and Kansas City, but unclear what role local staff played. Appropriately sized team with some past experience working together.

Weaknesses – Proposed approach failed to address anything related to bikeways and sidewalk repairs. Proposed two-month pre-project planning is unrealistic. Proposal lacked information related to partnering with other stakeholders. Proposal included a focus group approach method. Proposal lacked detail related to outreach mechanism to be utilized. Proposal failed to provide details related to how the major & collector street plan would be used in prioritizing projects. Proposal failed to address current litigation for the prime and/or subconsultants as requested in the evaluation criteria. Primary qualifications gaps in urban bikeway design and data collection.

Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc

Strengths – Proposal demonstrated 15+ years of sidewalk and bikeway program manager experience. Known project management team with almost all relevant staff in Nashville. Acknowledged Metro’s desire to change contracting method; proposal stated that program manager would develop a PMSOP. Proposal detailed a high level of urban bikeway planning and design expertise. Proposal’s Management Plan and Approach gave through detail

**RFQ 1388657 - SIDEWALK AND BIKEWAY PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Offerrer	Alfred Benesch & Company	Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc	Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc	Volkert Inc
Management Plan and Approach (45 points)	38.00	40.00	41.00	38.00
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.00	31.00	34.00	30.00
Relevant Project Experience (20 points)	16.00	17.00	16.00	16.00
Total (100 points)	86.00	88.00	91.00	84.00

Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc (Continued)

of different program aspects/challenges. Proposal demonstrated high level of understanding of constraints to the development of different types of sidewalk designs. Proposal provided detail of various work products used in the past (constructability audit reports, business plans, program management plans, etc.).

Weaknesses – Proposal lacked detailed related to how the experience of key team members is linked to the scope. Proposal demonstrated limited Program Management experience outside of Metro Nashville. Proposed project manager lacked details related to past work project. Proposal identified several litigations for either the prime and/or subconsultants. Submitted proposal failed to provide new and innovative approaches as requested in the RFP. Proposal failed to demonstrate an approach that includes unique value-added activities that increase efficiency, effectiveness, and overall quality of the program. Proposal demonstrated a lack of awareness of issues with the current program by not including anything new related to communication, budgets, and/or timeliness. All proposed applications are the prime’s propriety development tools.

Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc

Strengths – Proposed team has program management experience specifically with Metro Water Services and Public Works Solid Waste Master Plan. Proposed team structure has a strong public relations perspective. Proposal demonstrated a transit team structure perspective and approach. Proposed team structure shows relevant experience directly tied to the two project managers. Proposal demonstrated relevant planning and transit project experience along with program management experience for drainage projects. Proposal included one complete street project. Proposed project management plan included numerous site visits. Proposed approach included identifying issues with current program including but not limited to reviewing the effectiveness of the communication tracker tool currently being utilized. Proposed a video ride road perspective tool that allows a view of what the sidewalk

**RFQ 1388657 - SIDEWALK AND BIKEWAY PROGRAM MANAGEMENT SERVICES
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Evaluation Criteria/Offerrer	Alfred Benesch & Company	Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc	Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc	Volkert Inc
Management Plan and Approach (45 points)	38.00	40.00	41.00	38.00
Team Structure, Qualifications, and Capacity (35 points)	32.00	31.00	34.00	30.00
Relevant Project Experience (20 points)	16.00	17.00	16.00	16.00
Total (100 points)	86.00	88.00	91.00	84.00

Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc (Continued)

and/or bikeway would look like. Proposal included a lesson learn sessions throughout contract life.

Weaknesses – Proposed relevant project experience and qualifications of team members lacked sidewalk experience. Proposal lacked demonstrating successful experience working together on previous projects of similar size, scope and complexity. Relevant project experience submitted failed to include dates of projects. Proposal lacked project specific details related what the summary deliverables would be at public meetings. Right of way approach demonstrated lack of detail.

Volkert Inc

Strengths – Proposed approach included early coordination of utilities. Proposal included identifying projects that are already designed and assessing them for potential value engineering. Proposal included updating annually the five-year business plan that would consider the constructability reports, value engineering results, and stakeholder coordination. Approach took into consideration the of new Design-Build element of the program.

Weaknesses - Proposal lacked demonstrating experience for proposed program manager performing scope of work. Resumes lacking detail for proposed team project manager. Proposed program manager is a principle which drives concern related to the approach for cost savings. Overall proposed team structure lacked experience of similar size. Relevant project experience is limited as it relates to program management. Proposal demonstrated TDOT experience rather than experience of similar size and complexity. Proposal demonstrated litigations for prime.

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Jeremy Frye
Contract Specialist: Terri Ray
Date: 11/15/2019
Department Name: Public Works
RFP/ITB Number: 1388657

Project Name: Sidewalk and Bikeway Program Management Services (A&E)

Primary Contractor	SBE/SDV Requirement Acknowledged?	Comments
Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc.	Yes	Proposer acknowledged the 15% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. The prime is an approved SBE and proposed the engagement of SBE firm Wilmot Inc. .
Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc.	Yes	Proposer acknowledged the 15% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms Varallo Public Relations, Inc. and Design Consultants, Inc. .
Alfred Benesch & Company	Yes	Proposer acknowledged the 15% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms Design Consultants, Inc. and Civil Infrastructure Associates, LLC.
Volkert Inc.	Yes	Proposer acknowledged the 15% SBE/SDV participation expectation over the life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE firms Design Consultants, Inc. Civil Infrastructure Associates, LLC, Wilmot, Inc., NuOrigin, and Pillars Development, LLC.

EBO Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Public Works

RFP/ITB Number: 1388657

Sidewalk and Bikeway Program Management Services (A&E)

Primary Contractor	Met Established EBO Goals (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Lamar Dunn & Associates, Inc.	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program having acknowledge M/WBE goals and can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Fairpointe Planning, LLC (MBE) and Wilmot, Inc. (WBE).Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
Civic Engineering and Information Technologies, Inc.	No	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program having acknowledge M/WBE goals unable to achieve and providing acceptable Good Faith Summary Sheets as arequired by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Design Consultants, Inc. (MBE) and Varallo Public Relations (WBE) .Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
Alfred Benesch & Company	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program having acknowledge M/WBE goals and can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Design Consultants, Inc. (MBE) and Civil Infrastructure Associates (WBE) .Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
Volkert Inc.	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Equal Business Opportunity Program having acknowledge M/WBE goals and can achieve as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Design Consultants, Inc. (MBE), NuOrigin System,Inc (MBE), Civil Infrastructure Associates (WBE), Wilmot, Inc (WBE), and Pillars Development (MBE) .Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.

*Denotes Contractor with whom follow up was required
 Date: 11/18/2019
 Metro Buyer: Terri Ray
 BAO Rep: Jeremy Frye